

Experience in Building Networks in The Russian Tourist Market

Roman Petrovich Sklyarenko^{1*}
Valentina Mikhailovna Feoktistova²

1. Russian State University of Tourism and Service, Moscow, Russia.
2. Russian State University of Tourism and Service, Moscow, Russia.

*Corresponding Author. Email: sklyarenko.r.p@mail.ru

ABSTRACT: The development of the tourist services market in Russia began in 1991 with the permission to travel outside the state border for tourist purposes given to Soviet citizens. Uncertainty and lack of understanding of the economic processes that took place in the world allowed Russian travel agencies to receive superprofits in the first years of liberalization on the organization of mass outbound tourism of Russians. Ten years later, companies transited to more organized forms of doing business, and alliances, consortia, and network structures began to emerge in the outbound tourism market. In the world, the transition to such forms of business took decades, while in Russia entrepreneurs adopted methods of doing business from abroad, which led to mass bankruptcy of such organizations due to the inability of long-term financial planning in the context of the unpredictable behavior of the ruble and developing tax reform. The next stage of business formalization and the entry of national franchise networks into the Russian tourist market began in the 2010s. By this time, the Russian economy had somewhat stabilized and became attractive to international transnational structures. In Russia, they specialized in organizing outbound tourism for Russian citizens. Then, by purchasing the necessary hotel spaces in Russia, they organized inbound tourism for foreign citizens from home countries of their corporate headquarters. Thus, foreign network companies got advantages over national companies that did not have experience in the premium segment.

Keywords: service technologies, tourism, franchising, commercial concession.

INTRODUCTION

The problem in mass servicing of the population is the lack of high standards, caused by high competition in the tourist services market. This is largely due to the lack of mass tourism institutions. Until today, millions of people living in Russia have never seen the capital of their own country or the sea coast (Sklyarenko, 2004). Recent research on the tourism sector development through the international transfer of new technologies shows a continuous increase in the involvement of the population of the interior of the world in international tourism. This is evidenced by the works of E.Y. Nikolskaya, V.A. Lepeshkin, E.A. Blinova, I.P. Kulgachev, S.V. Ilkevich (2019); D.A. Kozlov (2017); P. Kumar, A. Mishra (2015); L. Moradi, Ya. Yahya, I. Mohamed, K. Raisian (2017); and N. Wulandari (2017).

All data indicate a sharp increase in the number of tourist arrivals, which leads to the need to prepare the national tourist infrastructure to meet the requirements of international industry norms and traditions, purchase service technologies, and develop service standards (Sklyarenko, 2007). The authors used materials from leading Russian news agencies and periodicals for the period from 1991 to 2018. The study of the source base allowed formulating the following hypothesis of the study. The creation of franchise networks led to the bankruptcy of several Russian tour operators. The most prudent tour operators, even before switching to franchising, passed the stage of forming the base of their travel agencies. The research methods chosen by the authors in the course of the study include a historical method of comparison and analysis, a descriptive method of poorly formalized processes, as well as surveys of entrepreneurs.

In the course of the research, a fairly in-depth analysis of current publications on the development of franchising in Russia was carried out. Publications were selected from the databases of leading Russian news agencies and periodicals dealing with Russian business. Certain provisions of the study were discussed with Russian entrepreneurs, who suffered bankruptcy in the course of taking part in franchise networks in the period from 2014 to 2018. The conducted study has resulted in the understanding that not all forms of business that have developed in Russia will be able to maintain their efficiency and bring profit if they are transformed into the forms of franchising relationships traditional in the world. This is due to insufficient experience in managing network structures, insufficient funds spent at previous stages to form a brand, and a lack of understanding of the working principles in the international tourism market. Russian companies are forced to learn by attracting the attention of international companies to their achievements, and often fully integrating into international tourist and hotel networks.

RESULTS

Currently, Russian travel companies are at the beginning of creating network organizations. The association of independent tourism structures is the most common form of reducing financial costs and increasing visibility on the market. These can be different types of strategic alliances, including franchising companies. The association is beneficial to both tour operators and tour agents. Tour operators benefit from creating their agency networks, as this will allow them to deal with reliable, permanent partners. And travel agencies, due to the association, can enhance the effect of market presence, increase brand awareness, and reduce marketing expenses. Also, network agents can expect to sell complex, and therefore more expensive tour packages.

Speaking about the history of the first networks in the tourist industry, it should be remembered that after the crisis of 1998, the demand of the Russian population for tourist services fell sharply, which contributed to the creation of various types of franchising associations. Therefore, the year 1998 was marked by the appearance of several large network associations, namely, Metropol-Express¹ (Metropol Group of companies, n.d.), Magazin Goryaschikh Putyevok² (n.d.), as well as 1001 Tur³ (Turism.ru, n.d.) and Kuda.ru, which appeared a few years later.

At this time in Russia, in addition to official networks, agents appear around large tour operators. For example, the travel agency Neva⁴ (the oldest travel company in Russia, currently bankrupt (MIA Russia today, n.d.)), in addition to the network of eight travel agencies located in St. Petersburg, in 2002, created a network of agencies in

Moscow, which included 11 legally independent companies. They performed under the brand of Neva, received legal support, and the opportunity to train employees at the company's head office, and took advantage of the company's advertising campaigns. At the same time, under the terms of cooperation, agencies had the right to sell only the services of Neva. They could address another tour operator only if Neva did not work with a certain destination. Until 2014, the company ran 80 offices in both capitals.

Starting from 2001-2002, franchising networks in the tourism sector services began to differ in their size, duration of operation, as well as the conditions for joining and functioning of agencies in the network. Besides, they differed in terms of recognition. For example, the Magazin Goryaschikh Putyevok was ahead of the 1001 Tur by its recognition among the population. The ancestor of the tourist franchise in Russia is the still existing Magazin Goryaschikh Putyevok (n.d.). The first shop was opened in the early summer of 1998. Its range consisted of tours created by various operators, which were offered at discounted prices. The economic foundation of this project was created based, first, on optimizing the loading of aircraft and accommodation facilities, and second, on the natural desire of customers to save money. Already in the spring of 1999, the network began to work intensively both in the regions of Russia and in several CIS countries. In the early 2000s, 503 travel agencies were already operating under the brand name of Magazin Goryaschikh Putyevok, of which 245 worked in Moscow and the regions of Russia, the remaining ones operated in the CIS countries.

The head office of the network of Magazin Goryaschikh Putyevok has 33 full-time employees, while the total number of employees in the offices of the association is about 1,500 people. The company's head office focuses on advertising and brand promotion, training and professional development of travel agency employees, development of the association, attracting new participants, advising the association's members on contractual relations with tour operators and tourists, assistance in resolving disputes and conflict situations, protecting the legal rights of the association's members, including preventing the illegal use of the network brand of Magazin Goryaschikh Putyevok.

The Don't Worry service (Cataloxy, n.d.) is actively developing to help customers of the Magazin Goryaschikh Putyevok network. The Magazin Goryaschikh Putyevok is a travel agency in the system of Cataloxy, which is a free advertising space designed to help businesses to attract new customers via the Internet in Moscow. This concerns on-the-spot solutions to the problems of travelers, direct interaction with representatives of tour operator companies and host parties, and technical support for the association's members.

A feature of the network concerns the unification of the operation technology of all offices (common prices, service, and information field), a bet on advanced Internet technologies, high requirements for offices, compliance with common standards, high efficiency of updating information by the marketing department, as well as advertency to pricing policy. Each travel agency that is part of the Magazin Goryaschikh Putyevok network receives the following package of services: exclusive right to use the Magazin Goryaschikh Putyevok trademark; territorial integrity; an advertising campaign regularly conducted by the head office; increased commission rate from leading tour operators; software package; legal and accounting support; round-the-clock support service for tourists abroad; call center service with the translation of all calls to any office in the regions of Russia; special marketing and advertising events with partners of

both tourism and related businesses; assistance in staff retraining: seminars, and certification of office employees.

Networks Kuda.ru and Metropol Express began to sell their franchises following to the Magazin Goryaschikh Putyevok. Kuda.ru network's goal was to help agencies maintain their independence and at the same time strengthen their market positions. The goal was set according to the rules of franchising adopted around the world. First of all, the agency got access to proven technologies for conducting tourist business. The franchisor was the company Touralliance LLC, while the role of the franchisee was played by travel agencies.

The operation technology of travel agencies in the network was strictly standardized: from the client's phone call (the script of a telephone conversation) to the time of their return from the trip. The selection was made based on three basic principles: convenient location of the office, the expertise of the staff, and loyalty to the network. The operation system of Kuda.ru network was as follows: each agency joining the network had to pay an entrance fee of 40,000-45,000 rubles, and in the future, the agency had to pay about 5,000-6,000 rubles a week, the so-called marketing fee for an advertising campaign.

Tour operators, whose product was sold by Kuda.ru agencies, provided project participants with an increased commission of 12-18% depending on the destination. The agency, in turn, was obliged to give 2% of the product turnover to the network. Joining the network provided travel agencies with the following advantages: a unified corporate identity of the network, active advertising, legal protection and independence, staff training, and a unified information system. Legal agency Persona Grata helped the Kuda.ru network members to prepare all the documentation required, while the Moscow Regional Bar Association provided support in solving specific problems with operators, clients, etc.

The Touralliance management company was exclusively engaged in strategic management issues, which included business processes, structure, legal protection, training, and other issues, while agencies were legally independent organizations. This means that they paid rent and wages to their employees by themselves. Franchisees had the right to work with the tour operator not being the network member, provided that the product met the standards of the Kuda.ru. If the Touralliance company had doubts about the quality of the product of this operator, the travel agent was recommended to suspend work with this company. If the travel agent was not listening to the opinion of the management company, it could be excluded from the network.

The network's common budget helped to organize and pay for training for its franchisees. Special classes for network employees were provided on the basics of sales psychology, the work of a travel agency manager, country studies, including climate features, and even the local mentality. In 2010, the cost of running a business exceeded incoming profits many times, and the Kuda.ru network ceased to exist. The Metropol-Express network was created in 1997 with the participation of the Metropol investment company and the commercial bank of the same name. The business of Metropol-Express started with the companies that remained after the bankruptcy of the Academservice travel company. Also, the companies that were part of Metropol-Express acted as a single legal entity. There was pronounced vertical management, that is, all negotiations and contracts with suppliers were managed by the head office, while employees of all other offices just sent their requests to head office, which might be explained by the fact that each of these networks worked with a specific operator and Metropol company.

The main activities of the company are popular summer destinations (Spain, Bulgaria, Malta, and Crete), winter destinations (UAE, Thailand, and several ski resorts), as well as holidays in Russia, and the organization of individual tours. In 2002, the network began an active expansion into the regions of Russia, namely, 10 agencies were created in Vladimir, Penza, Cherepovets, Vologda, and Izhevsk. Currently, the Metropol-Express network has more than 40 offices in various regions of Russia. The management of the Metropol-Express network is carried out by the management department of the travel agencies network. The company plans to further expand the network. Due to the presence of a common management center, franchisees, being a part of the network, do not bear the costs associated with the organization of the management process and promotion expenses. In turn, the department provides unified management of all financial flows of network participants. The network's software consists of a single database for all franchise participants.

Currently, the Metropol-Express network consists of both its agencies and the agencies working with the Metropol-Express network on the terms of franchisees. The franchise package offered for use by the company's partners includes a system of special discounts, advertising support, ensuring the sale of air tickets, as well as the use of a trademark, know-how in the business organization, the marketing concept, consulting, and training of personnel. The Metropol-Express network has a strict procedure for monitoring the standards and technologies adopted in the network, providing also a procedure for termination of the franchise agreement with a tourist organization if the specified conditions are not met.

A travel agency 1001 Tur organized in the early 2000s based on the turizm.ru forum now includes more than 150 offices, of which 100 were open under the franchise. The head office of the 1001 Tur chose business partners on equal terms with the franchisee, and only strategic and operational management and marketing activities were the responsibility of the head office. The franchise package includes the right to use a trademark, select premises, and personnel, as well as technology for performing all operations and business processes, perform accounting procedures, access to an information system, provide methodological assistance in the business organization, conduct staff training, and use centralized advertising support.

The TEZ TOUR RETAIL (TTR) franchise project has been functioning since 2003. Currently, it involves about 110 companies in Moscow and about the same number in various regions. The advantages for TTR working under the franchise scheme are that the agency receives the brand of a major tour operator, its support and technologies, while the tour operator receives the agency's clients. At the end of 2005, the Roza Vetrov (with a turnover of USD 27.5 million in 2005) united 14 agencies under its trademark. Roza Vetrov is the first private travel company in Russia, which was founded in 1988. The company is the national tour operator of Russia. Currently, it is a holding company consisting of operator companies and a network of travel agencies working under a single brand. Today, more than 100 travel agencies operate under the brand of Roza Vetrov with a single access site. (Roza Vetrov, n.d.). The parent company was engaged in document control and personnel training, as well as marketing, and merchandising.

Later, all major tour operators on the Russian market started selling franchises. The main reason for such a wide implementation of franchising among Russian tour operators was the urgent need to create guaranteed sales channels for tourist products.

However, tour operators did not immediately turn to the franchise model of organizing their retail chain. For example, in 2006, Intourist launched its network

project under the united brand of Intourist Travel Shop⁵ (n.d.) and started developing the network by opening its travel agencies. The development of an in-house network of travel agencies is an important step towards launching a franchise program. In-house sales offices guarantee the stability of the entire structure, create technologies to support franchisees, and a common sales culture. It is easier for new project participants to join an existing sales mechanism, which gives them a sense of security. Currently, the Intourist Travel Shop network has more than 50 in-house and franchised travel agencies, united under a single brand.

The advantages of operating travel agencies in the network include the use of the world-famous Intourist brand with an 80-year history, increased commission from tour operators, a convenient booking system that allows booking tours quickly and effectively, a unified call center, minimizing advertising costs, a bright and recognizable corporate style, legal support and advice, as well as opportunity to allocate information on the site. In March 2010, the international multiprofile tour operator Capital Tour launched a project named Franchising. Data from the official website of Capital Tour for the period of 2018-2019 (Capital Tour, n.d.). The Capital Tour partners, involved in the project, could sell tours and travel services to the company as official representatives of the tour operator working with private clients.

For travel agencies, the Franchise project provided the advantages of a turnkey agency business, including equipping the office with the necessary equipment and tools, using the extensive capabilities of the business model and technologies of a large multiprofile tour operator, selling air and railway tickets, as well as tour packages named Tour in 15 Minutes, booking hotels abroad, offering car rental and credit provision to tourists. This allowed offering newcomers an increased commission of 14% for one year, regardless of sales volumes, and compensating the agency's expenses for opening a franchise office to the tour operator. Employees of the Capital Tour Moscow and regional offices assessed the feasibility of the agency's participation in the project based on its sales indicators and the convenience of the office location.

In the event of disputes, when applications were received from several agencies located in the same area or near the same metro station, the agencies with higher sales rating had an advantage. If the Capital Tour was making a positive decision to include the travel agency in the project, a corresponding agreement was signed between the parties. At the end of the year, the amount of the franchisee's commission was calculated based on the company's sales volume and following the agent fee scale adopted by the Capital Club. At that, Capital Tour had its corporate brand-book. Brand-book is a set of rules exclusively for internal use, which is complemented by the special mandatory technical passport of standards called a guideline, designed for working with advertising agencies, marketing, and design departments.

Mandatory components of the guideline are brand constants, business documentation, registration of documents for end-users, marketing materials, outdoor advertising, Point of Sales Materials (POSM), souvenir gifts, and corporate dress-code. The agency must first agree with the Capital Tour on the design of the office and the location of the new premises. The opening of a franchise office of the company is carried out only after checking the premises by a representative of Capital Tour for compliance of the office design with corporate symbols.

Capital Tour produces corporate identity elements for the agency at its own expense. These include a signboard for fixing on the facade of the building, a sign with the work schedule, a promo panel with the tour operator's logo, POSM materials

(catalogs, booklets), office supplies, and other interior items with the Capital Tour corporate logo (calendars, maps, notebooks, pens, folders, wall clocks, etc.). Agency employees must thoroughly know the Capital Tour product, apply all the technologies used by the operator, and constantly improve their skills (taking part in advertising tours, and training seminars).

During the year of this project's existence, 50 travel agencies joined the franchising network of Capital Tour. At present, the Capital Tour does not exist. The cost of running an aggressive advertising campaign was not covered by the profit. On December 30, 2010, Capital Tour LLC and Capital Tour Company LLC (the largest companies of the holding) filed for bankruptcy in the Moscow Arbitration Court (Romanova, 2011). The bankruptcy of the Capital Tour accelerated the creation of the association called Turpomoshch (tourist assistance), the adoption of the law on the creation of guarantee funds in the travel industry, as well as mandatory insurance of tour operators' liability to customers (Federal law No. 132-FZ, 1996).

The research results indicate the problems hindering the development of franchising in the tourism sector services in Russia. They can be divided into three groups: economic, organizational-legal, and socio-psychological. Economic problems include: instability of the economic development of Russia; lack of necessary start-up capital in the majority of potential franchisees to enter the franchise system (Loshakov, Dolbilov, 2017); difficulties in obtaining loans to create start-up capital; lack of concepts and definitions in legislation, poor domestic experience, and fear of failure in the subjects of the franchise system.

Organizational-legal problems include: lack of qualified personnel willing to work in tourism; lack of experience in managing network holding structures and optimizing financial flows within the network (Sklyarenko, 2019); uncertain definition of the concept of franchising in Russian legislation. Socio-psychological problems include: low social status of tourism industry employees (Yudina et al., 2019); lack of mass tourist traffic in previous years (Savelev, 2009); required residence permit and registration at the place of stay, visa restrictions; lack of hotel rooms and tourist accommodation in Russia (Bystrov, 2018).

Therefore, the development of franchising in Russia requires further improvement of the legal framework, namely: ensuring the ease of application of legislation for participants in the franchise system; creating transparency of the franchise system, and its elements for regulatory authorities. It also makes sense for participants in franchising systems to implement a preferential tax regime. The findings of the present study suggest that the brands of tour operators are becoming more and more recognizable among Russian customers, and the trend of the loyalty of certain customers to a particular brand is becoming more obvious. By developing their retail network according to the franchise model, tour operators can take advantage of all the preferences of franchising. Now the tour operator will not need to open its own offices, because this will be done by the franchisee.

The results of the study fully confirm the initially formulated hypothesis. The stage of forming franchise networks did not end well for all Russian tour operators. However, the most prudent operators passed the stage of forming the base of their travel agencies even before switching to franchising. At this transitional stage, the main standards and technologies used in this area of tourism business development were tested and implemented, which later formed the basis of the tour operator's franchise.

Exactly at this stage, it is characterized by the active promotion of brands of individual large travel companies, as well as their participation in holding broad advertising campaigns to form the image of travel companies and increase their awareness among consumers. The franchisor may not deal with various types of management problems at each franchise enterprise, and therefore, the franchisor is devoid of numerous personnel problems, operational and technical difficulties. The risk associated with each business is reduced for the franchisor since its capital participates in the expansion of the franchise business to a minimum extent. At the same time, the tour operator's retail business is developing faster than if it worked with each of its travel agencies individually. Opening each new office is additional advertising for the brand in general. Even the signs above the entrances to travel agencies work as outdoor advertising. While taking into account the fact that brand development is closely linked to advertising, which is significantly affected by the economy of scale, franchising provides a mechanism for reducing the cost of promoting the company's brand.

CONCLUSION

The significance of the drawn conclusions lies in the fact that the Russian tourist market is rapidly expanding, while some undoubted leaders set conditions for small companies. Government agencies also actively support the largest domestic travel companies to develop a more effective coordination policy. In this context, it becomes almost impossible for small travel agencies to successfully operate independently. The importance of further research is to prepare for dramatic changes in the Russian tourist market, associated with the imposition of economic sanctions against Russian citizens, the closure of communications with China, and most importantly – in the mass-independent tourism of Russian youth abroad using Internet services for booking tickets and accommodation (Bunakov et al., 2018). Even today, holidays abroad are becoming cheaper than holidays within Russia (Bokareva et al., 2020). This is due to the growth of transaction costs in the Russian economy. This study does not describe the impact of large international tourism networks on the Russian tourist market. Competition between Russian and international networks is unpromising since Russia has not yet formed its large hotel networks, while the owners of individual facilities suitable for hosting foreign tourists are looking forward to new foreign franchises.

Footnotes:

1. The investment finance company Metropol started its activity in 1995, and operates in the markets of Europe, Asia, Africa, and America, running representative offices in the UK, Serbia, Montenegro, Japan, China, Canada, the Democratic Republic of the Congo, Vietnam, and Cyprus. The Group's companies operate in various areas, namely, exchange operations, financial management and consulting, banking and investment activities, development of deposits, real estate, and tourism markets, and support for innovative projects. The travel company Metropol-Express, as part of the Metropol Group, was founded in 1997.
2. The Magazin Goryaschikh Putyevok have a large and extensive network of 396 offices throughout Russia.

3. The 1001 Tur has been operating since 2002. Today it is a large network of travel agencies operating in Russian cities and CIS countries. All of the 218 offices operate according to the same quality standard, with a single on-line database of tours available at <https://www.1001tur.ru/beachrest/>. Since 2014, 1001 Tur has been a part of the TBS Group of companies. The TBS Group combines several well-known brands operating in the tourism business and has a large base of agencies and clients. The Group of companies includes the largest tour booking center, a network of TBS, 1001 Tur, and Master of Leisure travel agencies, as well as a ruSPO.ru search and booking system for tours, the Avianta online tours catalog, the HotelOut electronic catalog of hotels based on tourists' reviews and photos, and the most popular online catalog.

4. Federal state unitary enterprise International News Agency Russia Today reported that Neva travel agency owed to creditors of 1.2 billion rubles. The representative of the Investigative Committee at the Public Prosecutor's Office of the Russian Federation V. Markin reported on the initiation of criminal cases of fraud after the suspension of several Russian travel agencies. According to him, the owners of companies, knowing about the debts to their partners, continued to sell tours to customers, and thus "the activities of these tour operators turned into a financial pyramid".

5. Intourist Travel Shop is a company held by self-employed entrepreneur E.V. Bibikov. It is an authorized travel agency of the Intourist, operating based on the contract for the right to use the Intourist trademark (Agreement No. 300 of 1.11.2017) and to manage the Internet site.

REFERENCES

1. Bokareva, E.V., Silaeva, A.A., Sokolova, A.P., Atamanova, M.A., Zudenkova, S.A. (2020). The world oil market and its influence on the Russian economy. *Smart Innovation, Systems and Technologies*, 138, 568-578.
2. Bunakov, O.A., Zaitseva, N.A., Larionova, A.A., Zhukov, V.A., Morozova M.A., Dmitrieva, N.V. (2018). The use of the «soft power» concept in the modern Russian tourism industry. *Espacios*, 39(22), 2.
3. Bystrov, O.F. (2018). Metod prinyatiya resheniya v zadachah vybora na mnozhestve al'ternativ po mnozhestvu pokazatelej – metod BOFEM [Method of decision-making in selection problems on a set of alternatives based on a set of the indicators – BOFem method]. *Economic and socio-humanitarian research*. Publishing House of the National Research University Moscow Institute of Electronic Technology (MIET), 3, 12-18.
4. Capital Tour. Retrieved from: <http://capital-tour.com/contact/o-kompanii.html>
5. Cataloxy. Retrieved from: <https://moscow.cataloxy.ru/firms/mgp.ru.htm>.
6. Federal law No. 132-FZ. (1996). Ob osnovah turistskoj deyatel'nosti v Rossijskoj Federacii [On the basics of tourist activity in the Russian Federation]. Retrieved from: <https://rg.ru/1996/12/03/osnovy-turizma-dok.html>.
7. Intourist Travel Shop. Retrieved from: <http://intourist32.ru/>.

8. Kozlov, D.A. (2017). Agent technology in the hotel business. *Journal of Environmental Management and Tourism*, 8(2), 285-290.
9. Kumar, R., and Mishra, A. (2015). A study of economic contribution to the tourism industry in Jharkhand State. *Journal of Environmental Management and Tourism*, 6(1), 101-112.
10. Loshakov, A.S., Dolbilov, A.V. (2017). Obostrenie ugroz ekonomicheskoy bezopasnosti gosudarstva v usloviyah sankcionnogo protivostoyaniya [Aggravation of threats to the economic security of the state in the context of the sanction's standoff]. *Economics and Management: Problems, Solutions*, 2(1), 24-27.
11. Magazin Goryaschikh Putyevok. Retrieved from: <http://promo.mgp.ru/about/>.
12. Metropol Group of companies. Retrieved from: <http://www.metropolgroup.ru/partner/index.wbp>.
13. MIA Russia today. Retrieved from: <https://ria.ru/20150120/1043375555.html>.
14. Moradi, L., Yahya, Ya., Mohamed, I., Raisian, K. (2017). E-learning system acceptance factors for training: A study of employees' perception in the tourism industry. *Journal of Environmental Management and Tourism*, 8(6), 1250-1258.
15. Nikolskaya, Ye.Yu., Lepeshkin, V.A., Blinova, Ye.A., Kulgachev, I.P., Ilkevich, S.V. (2019). Improvement of digital technology in the tourism sector. *Journal of Environmental Management and Tourism*, 10(6), 1197-1201.
16. Romanova, T. (2011). Kapital'noe bankrotstvo [Capital bankruptcy]. *Bulletin*, 1(2767).
17. Roza Vetrov. Retrieved from: <http://www.roza-v.ru>.
18. Savelev, V.N. (2009). Simvoly i obrazy globalizacii [Globalization symbols and images]: monograph. Moscow: The Academy of Natural Sciences.
19. Sklyarenko, R.P. (2004). Rossiya na mirovom rynke tekhnologij [Russia on the global technology market]: Ph.D. thesis in Economic Sciences. Moscow: VNIIVES.
20. Sklyarenko, R.P. (2007). Osnovy mezhdunarodnogo tekhnologicheskogo sotrudnichestva [Fundamentals of international technological cooperation]. Moscow: Economist.
21. Sklyarenko, S.O. (2019). Dinamika ekonomik stran-chlenov Organizacii chernomorskogo ekonomicheskogo sotrudnichestva [Dynamics of the economies of the member countries of the Organization of the Black Sea Economic Cooperation]. *International Scientific Journal*, 6, 103-110.
22. Turizm.ru. Retrieved from: <https://www.turizm.ru/>.
23. Wulandari, N. (2017). Cashless payment in tourism: An application of the technology acceptance model. *Journal of Environmental Management and Tourism*, 8(8), 1550-1553.
24. Yudina, E.V., Panov, A.G., Lustina, T.N., and Podsevalova, E.N. (2019). An analysis of the potential for employing the methods of project management for strategic planning. *International Journal of Engineering and Advanced Technology*, 8(4), 1097-1099.